MA ENERGY EFFICIENCY ADVISORY COUNCIL

MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, January 22, 2025
Virtual Meeting via Zoom

Councilors Present:	Greg Abbe, Commissioner Elizabeth Mahony, Brian Beote, Audrey Hettinger, Paul Johnson, Steven Miller, Kyle Murray, William Rose, Sharon Weber, Brooks Winner, Martijn Fleuren, Meg Lusardi, Robert Rio, Cindy Carroll, Margaret Song (for Maggie Downey), Michael Ferrante, Kate Peters, Chris Porter, Stephanie Terach, Jillian Winterkorn, Tim Costa
Councilors Absent:	Alexis Washburn, Mary Wambui, Daniel Leary
Consultants Present:	Adrian Caesar, Gretchen Calcagni, Margie Lynch, Griff Keating
DOER Staff Present:	Ina Dasso, Alissa Whiteman, Jo Ann Bodemer, Rachel Evans

1. Call to Order

Bodemer, acting on behalf of the Chair, called the meeting to order at 1:02 PM.

Virtual Meeting Procedure
Bodemer reviewed the virtual EEAC meeting procedure:

1. The Council meeting will be recorded, for administrative purposes only.
2. All attendees except for Councilors and presenters will remain muted for the duration of the meeting.
3. Councilors should hold comments until the end of presentations, but Councilors and other participants should speak instead of using any chat function.
4. Councilors who disconnect from meetings need to announce when they rejoin.
5. All Council votes will be taken by roll call.

2. Public Comment

No meeting participants provided public comment.

3. Council Business and Updates

Department of Energy Resources (DOER) Updates
Bodemer stated that she and Commissioner Mahony participated in the MassSave Climate Leaders Award Ceremony. Bodemer highlighted a Climate Leader award that Commissioner Mahony presented to Emmett Lyne, on behalf of the Program Administrators (PAs), for his longstanding dedication to the delivery of energy efficiency and decarbonization programs in the Commonwealth.

Evans announced that the provision in Open Meeting Law allowing for virtual and hybrid open meetings is due to expire in March, so the Council should plan to meet in person again for all meetings starting in April, unless the legislature acts before then to change it.

November 6, 2024 and December 4, 2024 EEAC Executive Committee Meeting Minutes
Bodemer asked if the Executive Committee had any revisions to the November and December EEAC Executive Committee Meeting Minutes. No Executive Committee members proposed edits. DOER, as Chair of the Executive Committee, approved the November and December EEAC Executive Committee Meeting Minutes as submitted.

November 20, 2024 and December 18, 2024 EEAC Executive Committee Meeting Minutes
Bodemer asked if the Council had any revisions to the November and December EEAC Meeting Minutes. Rose said that the December EEAC Meeting Minutes should indicate that he would not be available for the proposed January 22 in-person meeting. DOER, as Chair of the Council, approved the November and December EEAC Meeting Minutes as amended.

Rose shared that the Office of the Attorney General (AGO) released a report on electric supply[1].

Murray asked if the Council could send a letter to the Legislature in support of remote meeting rules. Murray said that requiring more in-person meetings will create difficulties for Councilors. Bodemer asked the Councilors to email Dasso if they are in support of extending remote meetings, then DOER will discuss how to proceed internally. Commissioner Mahony suggested that Councilors share where they primarily conduct their business to help the Legislature understand that there are members across the States. Commissioner Mahony said that the EEAC will need to carefully consider how they communicate their request because they have never sent a letter like this before, but providing information to the Legislature is always beneficial. Commissioner Mahony said that the Open Meetings Law applies to both State and Municipal public boards.

Murray asked if DOER could send calendar holds for the remaining EEAC meetings for the year. Bodemer said that DOER can discuss this internally. Caesar said that alternatively, Councilors can register for meetings in advance via the links on the online EEAC Calendar.

Program Administrator Updates
Porter announced the tragic passing of Marie Abdou in December 2024. Porter praised Marie for her leadership in developing world-leading programs in Massachusetts and highlighted her

[1] https://www.mass.gov/doc/2025-ago-competitive-electric-supply-report-1152025/download

foundational work which enabled the success of energy efficiency in the state. Porter asked everyone to join the PAs in keeping Marie's husband Alex and two children, Julian and Vivian, in their thoughts and prayers, and that everyone consider supporting organizations that combat cancer. Bodemer said that she, and many others at DOER, knew Marie and viewed her as a special part of the energy-efficiency world.

4. EEAC Priorities for 2025

Bodemer reviewed the Draft Council Priorities for 2025, which had been updated to reflect Councilor feedback.

Council Discussion and Vote
Abbe asked for clarity on which "actors" were referenced in the Council priority to, "coordinate efforts to achieve a holistic view, interacting with state agencies and other actors." Bodemer suggested that stakeholders would be a more appropriate term.

Murray motioned. Rio seconded. All were in favor, with none opposed or abstaining. The Council approved its 2025 Priorities, as amended.

5. Proposed 2025-2027 Equity Targets

EWG Update
Bodemer, on behalf of the EEAC Equity Working Group (EWG), shared the proposed Equity Targets for 2025-2027, to assess progress towards planned commitments and outcomes. Bodemer said that the EWG had vetted and discussed the Equity Targets over the course of several months, but the EWG and the PAs can revise the document during the Plan Term.

6. 2025 EEAC Consultant Workplan and Budget

Calcagni reviewed the 2025 EEAC Consultant Workplan, which describes key work areas, Consultant team members, and proposed budgets for each work area. Calcagni explained that the proposed budget includes a travel allocation, but not enough to accommodate monthly, in-person meetings, if those are required.

Bodemer also reviewed the 2025 EEAC administrative budget of $50,000, which would cover costs for meeting spaces, events, and additional facilitation or technical support.

Winner joined the virtual meeting at 1:40 PM.

Council Discussion and Vote
Johnson said that he appreciates the work and insight that Belliveau has provided over the past several years. Johnson asked who the Analyst included in the budget is. Calcagni said that there are several analysts that support EEAC work, not one specific person assigned. Johnson requested to see the Consultant rates per hour. Johnson said that the EEAC Consultants have an average of $217 per hour, and he asked how this compares to prior years. Calcagni said that their contract includes an annual escalation in rates to account for inflation, which is a 3% year over year increase. Johnson asked if there will be a clean heat standard working group. Calcagni said

that there will not be a dedicated working group, but the EEAC Consultants will be tracking and reporting. Johnson said that the EEAC Consultants do a good job overall.

Hettinger joined the virtual meeting at 1:45 PM.

Weber motioned to approve. Beote seconded. All were in favor with none opposed or abstaining. The Council approved the 2025 EEAC Consultant Workplan and Budget.

7. Councilor Spotlight

Councilor Spotlight: Commissioner Mahony
Commissioner Mahony described her educational background, professional experience, pathway to becoming the Commissioner of DOER, and fun facts about herself.

Commissioner Mahony said that she loves her team at DOER as they challenge her, impress her, and make her laugh. Commissioner Mahony said that the DOER team conducts impactful work, but they do so creatively, while engaging with many stakeholder groups.

Rose left the virtual meeting at 2:00PM.

8. Proposed 2025 EEAC Meeting Topics

DOER Overview
Bodemer presented proposed EEAC meeting dates and topics but noted that meeting agendas are subject to change throughout the year. Bodemer added that Councilors can provide input on proposed meeting topics at any time.

9. 2022-2024 End-of-Term Projections

PA Presentation
Peters, Beote, and Porter, on behalf of the PAs, presented preliminary outcomes and observations from the 2022-2024 Term, portfolio-level performance, and sector-specific highlights. Peters clarified that the presentation is based on preliminary results and subject to further quality-assurance/quality-control (QA/QC) review.

Council Discussion
Johnson said that it seems counter-intuitive that progress in Moderate-Income customer participation would be slower due to self-attestation. Peters said that the data in the portal for Moderate-Income customer qualification decreased in 2024, but it is likely because more customers were using self-attestation and did not need to use the Moderate-Income application portal.

Fleuren asked how current progress for Moderate-Income customer participation compares to the planned values for 2025-2027. Peters estimated that the volume would increase in the 2025-2027 Term. Fleuren said that the PAs should present annual home energy assessment (HEA) and weatherization job volume for the 2022-2024 Term. Fleuren believed that both had decreased

year over year. Peters said that the PAs would need to compile the full-Term HEA and weatherization data. Keating said that the Moderate-Income weatherization goal grows from 6,000 in 2025 to 12,000 in 2027, and the heat pump goal increases from 2,000 in 2025 to 2,500 in 2027. Keating said that compared to 2024, this is a substantive increase. Lynch said that the EEAC Consultants presented HEA and weatherization data through 2024 Q3, and there is trend data for the 2022-2024 Term HEAs in the weatherization presentation from the December EEAC meeting.

Weber requested a comparison between Low-Income heat-pump data in the 2022-2024 Term and the 2025-2027 Plan. Peters said that 2024 production is below the 2025 Plan value, and production will be ramping up throughout the next Term. Weber said that the 2024 production levels bode well for even greater achievement in the 2025-2027 Term.

Winner asked if the PAs could expand on the impacts of self-attestation and confirm whether it improves Moderate-Income customer participation. Peters said that the PAs only have anecdotal evidence from contractors so far. Peters said that the PAs would need to explore data on pathways for Moderate-Income customer participation. Winner said that the Equity Targets include a built-in ramp for Moderate-Income activity in the 2025-2027 Term. Winner said that the planned numbers for weatherization and heat pumps are significantly greater than preliminary performance, so structural changes will hopefully help the PAs meet or exceed planned goals in the next Term.

Johnson said that heat pumps and weatherization jobs in November and December of 2024 were lower than that of 2023. Johnson asked why heat pump installations increased but weatherization jobs decreased. Peters said that annual compiled data would help reconcile these differences, but the PAs have struggled with Market-Rate weatherization. Peters said that over 90,000 HEAs and over 36,000 weatherization jobs were completed, so the PAs need to consider why some homes are receiving audits. Peters said that newer homes may not receive recommendations for audits or customers may just not be moving forward with the audits. Peters said that the PAs want to analyze and understand this, as they have served many homes. Johnson said that heat pump production suggests a notable shortcoming with weatherization production. Peters said that whole-home heat-pump installations require weatherization, but partial-displacement does not. Peters said that customers can meet the weatherization requirements if the home is below a certain age, if the customer does not receive a recommendation for weatherization following the HEA, or if the customer implements the recommended weatherization measures. Peters added that customers have six months to meet weatherization requirements. Bodemer said that there is not a direct correlation between weatherization and heat pump production, but the PAs need to further investigate whether there is an issue. Johnson asked how Home Performance Contractor (HPC) and lead-vendor production for HEAs compared to 2023. Johnson asked what can be done to increase lead-vendor production because the Independent Insulation Contractors (IICs) said that they are not getting enough work from lead vendors. Peters said that HPCs completed 54% of weatherization work, but there is a fairly robust mix between HPCs and IICs. Peters said that marketplace variety is important, and both HPCs and lead vendors need to increase output. Peters said that the PAs need to investigate and discuss how to improve marketing and customer targeting. Fleuren said that HPCs have struggled to drive performance, so he was not surprised

by lead vendor performance challenges. Fleuren agreed that increased marketing would help all contractors.

Johnson asked for greater detail on Community First Partnership (CFP) activities, specifically the location of tabling activities, and for clarification on partnership development. Peters said that All In Energy has summarized activities for the PAs, but they have not reviewed the detailed term results yet. Johnson said that canvassing is a good activity for the CFPs. Johnson said that CFPs often partner with All In Energy or HPCs like HomeWorks to drive customer acquisition.

Winner said that the EWG thought that it would be helpful to see data on the impact of CFPs on increasing customer participation in their communities. Winner said that data can help the EEAC understand how to improve CFP outreach and underscore the value of the CFPs.

Fleuren said that Clean Energy Pathways (CEP) metrics are helpful. Fleuren said that he wanted to see MassCEC produce the same workforce development metrics. Fleuren asked if the PAs could track the retention rate among CEP interns. Peters said that the PAs can do some follow up, and they have a post survey that may provide additional insights.

Johnson asked why the PAs have only achieved about 20% of what was planned. Porter said that the PAs set high electrification goals and filed MTMs, but there were several challenges to electrification like customer economics for larger customers, technical feasibility, and long project timelines. Porter said that the PAs hope that changes for the 2025-2027 Term will increase production to capture near-term opportunities while considering long-term approaches to electrifying large buildings.

Weber reiterated that there is a need to stay on top of measures that are falling behind. Weber said that if the PAs targeted this in 2022, they could have addressed the challenges sooner.

Rio said that C&I customers do not want to take significant risks with newer technologies, especially if they do not save money through electrification. Rio said that some have carbon-related goals and may have electrified despite cost considerations, but others will receive economic pushback. Rio said that retrofits can be challenging because certain buildings were constructed with specific technologies in mind. Rio said that he acknowledges the challenges characterized by the PAs. Bodemer said that the C&I Working Group (CIWG) includes C&I customers, the EEAC Consultants, and the PAs. Bodemer recommended that Councilors refer any interested customers to the CIWG. Keating said that the 2025-2027 Plan projects savings of three million MMBtu in 2025 and five million MMBtu in 2026 and 2027, so the PAs are planning for ambitious growth relative to their achievements in the current Term. Keating said that he was excited to begin receiving quarterly measure-level data in the new Term. Porter said that the challenge is daunting, but the intent of the PAs' work is to spur market transformations. Porter said that many of the objectives and challenges with C&I Sector electrification were true in the Residential Sector, but the PAs have begun to change the narrative in the Commonwealth.

Winner asked for an estimate of the number of additional projects that are in development but are not reflected in the 2022-2024 achievement. Porter said that the PAs can follow-up, but they are

not expecting any more new-construction electrification in the 2025-2027 Plan given sales and development cycles for these projects.

Winner asked if the PAs have data on small business weatherization performance. Winner asked if the outcomes are positive or negative after launching the weatherization offer. Porter said that the PAs are reviewing measure-level data, but it will take time to increase weatherization output. Porter said that small business weatherization faces additional challenges including split incentives, a workforce that is unfamiliar with serving small businesses, and hesitation from business owners to shut down operations. Winner asked if the workforce is expanding. Porter said that there are sufficient workers with the technical capabilities, but the challenge lies in demonstrating opportunity to service providers such that they commit resources to small business weatherization. Winner asked what language-access enhancements have been implemented. Porter said that the PAs have focused on ensuring that all intake pathways can accommodate different languages. Porter said that the PAs are still assessing what is working and what is not working.

Johnson asked how the weatherization offer that was launched differs from previous offers. Porter said that it was previously a custom measure that required additional review by vendors and PAs, which lengthened sales cycles. Porter said that the PAs launched a prescriptive offer, which requires less work to move projects forward, in addition to the custom express tools for weatherization. Porter said both offers aim to streamline customer and contractor experience and expedite timelines. Johnson said that the PAs want contractors to reallocate resources from the Residential Sector to Small Businesses. Johnson asked how contractors will engage with small businesses. Porter said that there are a few mechanisms, but the PAs primarily work through turnkey vendors to identify weatherization opportunities, then either complete the work in-house or refer it to existing insulation contractors. Porter said that this is a prescriptive offer, and there is a better-defined pathway to bring in IICs. Porter said that IICs can identify work and market services to bring projects into the program. Porter said that the Customer Directed Option will allow customers to hire contractors of their choice so long as the work is consistent with program offerings.

Winner said that the PAs do not want to disappoint current Designated Equity Communities (DECs) if the DPU makes changes to the list. Winner said that this is a crucial piece of the Plan for meeting many of the renter-based Equity targets. Winner asked if the PAs would like stakeholder support in appropriately communicating potential offers to DECs. Peters said that it takes considerable time and effort to described offerings and community approaches. Peters said that the PAs try to align with the CFP offerings so that there will be a CFP in each DEC. Peters said that the PAs have many new things to develop and change internally, including staff allocations. Peters said that the PAs are considering how to best support community efforts and engagement. Winner said that having a point person in each community is helpful. Winner said that Chris McClellan had shared an interim summary of new and existing offerings, and the PAs should reach out to see if the Council and others can support their efforts. Bodemer said that she is optimistic that the Council's support for the Plan as filed will result in DPU approval, but DPU may change the approved offerings and designations of DECs.

10. Adjournment

Bodemer, acting on behalf of the Chair, adjourned the meeting at 3:57 PM.

Meeting Materials:

- Official Meeting Notice
- Meeting Link
- Agenda
- November 6, 2024 EEAC Executive Committee Meeting Minutes – DRAFT
- November 20, 2024 EEAC Meeting Minutes – DRAFT
- December 4, 2024 EEAC Executive Committee Meeting Minutes – DRAFT
- December 18, 2024 EEAC Meeting Minutes – DRAFT
- 2025 EEAC Budget Proposal
- 2025 EEAC Consultants Work Plan
- 2025 EEAC Consultants Work Plan Presentation
- 2025 Priorities by Categories Draft 1.17.25-Clean
- 2025 Priorities by Categories-Draft 1.17.25-Redline
- 2025 EEAC Meeting Topics
- 2025-2027 Equity Targets – Final
- 2022-2024 Preliminary Performance Review